



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO

MUNK
SCHOOL
OF
GLOBAL
AFFAIRS

Join the Global Conversation

G7 Research Group

The
G7 Research Group
at the Munk School of Global Affairs at Trinity College in the University of Toronto
presents the

2017 Taormina G7 Final Compliance Report

27 May 2017 to 25 May 2018

Prepared by
Katrina Bland, Andrew Liu and Sarah Mariani
G7 Research Group, University of Toronto

4 June 2018

www.g7.utoronto.ca

g7@utoronto.ca

@g7_rg

“We have meanwhile set up a process and there are also independent institutions monitoring which objectives of our G7 meetings we actually achieve. When it comes to these goals we have a compliance rate of about 80%, according to the University of Toronto. Germany, with its 87%, comes off pretty well. That means that next year too, under the Japanese G7 presidency, we are going to check where we stand in comparison to what we have discussed with each other now. So a lot of what we have resolved to do here together is something that we are going to have to work very hard at over the next few months. But I think that it has become apparent that we, as the G7, want to assume responsibility far beyond the prosperity in our own countries. That’s why today’s outreach meetings, that is the meetings with our guests, were also of great importance.”

Chancellor Angela Merkel, Schloss Elmau, 8 June 2015

G7 summits are a moment for people to judge whether aspirational intent is met by concrete commitments. The G7 Research Group provides a report card on the implementation of G7 and G20 commitments. It is a good moment for the public to interact with leaders and say, you took a leadership position on these issues – a year later, or three years later, what have you accomplished?

Achim Steiner, Administrator, United Nations Development Programme, in [G7 Canada: The 2018 Charlevoix Summit](#)

Contents

Preface.....	3
Research Team	4
Lead Analysts	4
Compliance Analysts and Editors.....	4
Executive Summary	6
The Final Compliance Score	6
Compliance by Member	6
Compliance by Commitment	6
The Compliance Gap Between Members	6
Future Research and Reports	6
Table A: 2017 Priority Commitments Selected for Assessment*.....	7
Table B: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores	9
Table C: 2017 G7 Taormina Interim Compliance Scores by Country	10
Table D: 2017 G7 Taormina Final Compliance Scores by Commitment.....	11
1. Terrorism: Aviation and Border Security.....	12
2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism.....	31
3. Terrorism: Syria.....	50
4. Non-proliferation: Nuclear Weapons and Disarmament	68
5. Trade: Protectionism and Trade Practices	93
6. Trade: Internationally Recognized Environmental Standards	113
7. Gender: Human Trafficking and Exploitation.....	131
8. Gender: Encouraging Women in the Private Sector.....	147
9. Gender: Intersecting Inequalities	162
10. Migration: Addressing the Drivers of Migration	174
11. Climate Change: Energy and Clean Technology	206
12. Climate Change: Paris Agreement.....	223
13. Food and Agriculture: Food Security and Nutrition.....	258
14. Development: African Union Agenda 2063.....	268
15. Health: Mental Health.....	285
16. Labour and Employment: Work Conditions	301
17. Macroeconomics: Inclusive Growth.....	318
18. Regional Security: Ukraine	336
19. Information and Communication Technology	352

2. Terrorism: Combating Online Extremism

“We will counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

G7 Taormina Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism and Violent Extremism

Assessment

Member	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Canada			+1
France			+1
Germany			+1
Italy		0	
Japan		0	
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.75	

Background

While it is still a relatively new phenomenon, terrorist organizations’ use of the internet has become one of the most complex and effective facets of their recruitment efforts.¹⁴⁶ Al Qaeda is known to be the terrorist group that initially used social media most effectively and frequently. Brian Jenkins, the senior advisor to the RAND Corporation, suggests that “while almost all terrorist organizations have websites, al Qaeda [was] the first to fully exploit the internet ... It regards itself as a global movement and therefore depends on a global communications network to reach its perceived constituents... Its leaders view communications as 90 percent of the struggle.”¹⁴⁷ Despite al Qaeda’s initial online prominence, the so-called Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) has completely revolutionized modern terrorism with its use of social media.¹⁴⁸

For ISIS and other terrorist organizations, propaganda serves a bifurcated purpose, and is not only used online. Terrorists’ presence, whether it be in the form of videos, magazines or photos, inspire like-minded individuals to convert to their ideology, but also incite fear and disgust in others.¹⁴⁹ Furthermore, terrorist groups can also use propaganda to threaten governments into action that is favourable to their aims. The challenges that face governments who seek to limit the impact of propaganda spread through the internet and social media often lie in the nature of social media. As platforms such as Twitter and Facebook are free to use, and anyone can easily create a new user if their previous account is banned or suspended, limiting the influence of terrorist groups on social

¹⁴⁶ How Terrorists Use the Internet, Operation 250 (No city) Access Date: 13 October 2017.
<https://www.operation250.org/how-terrorists-use-the-internet/>.

¹⁴⁷ Is Al-Qaeda’s Internet Strategy Working?, Brian Michael Jenkins, Testimony Before the House Homeland Security Committee (Washington, D.C.) December 2011. Access Date: 13 October 2017.
<https://homeland.house.gov/files/Testimony%20Jenkins%20.pdf>.

¹⁴⁸ How Terrorists Use the Internet, Operation 250 (No city) Access Date: 13 October 2017.
<https://www.operation250.org/how-terrorists-use-the-internet/>.

¹⁴⁹ How the Changing Media is Changing Terrorism, The Guardian (London) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/25/how-changing-media-changing-terrorism>.

media is extremely difficult. A Berger and Morgan study found that, between September and December 2014, at least 46,000 Twitter accounts were used by ISIS supporters.¹⁵⁰

Despite the inherent difficulties in countering online terrorist propaganda, there have been instances in which both foreign governments and industries have attempted to diminish the scope of these actions. In 2012 for example, Twitter fundamentally altered its censorship policy to comply with the free-speech policies of certain major countries around the world.¹⁵¹ What this meant was that, for example, in France and Germany, users would be banned from publishing tweets that contained pro-Nazi propaganda, as it is illegal in those countries.¹⁵² Additionally, in the United States, after the beheading of American aid worker Peter Kassig in 2014, his family requested that the news media not display any segment of the video published by ISIS, in an attempt to limit the effects it had, in terms of both potential recruitment and in inciting terror, within the United States and abroad.¹⁵³ Notwithstanding these efforts, online terrorist presence still remains a major medium through which terrorist organizations disseminate their propaganda, recruit, and incite violence around the world.

At previous G7/8 summits, members have focused on the issue of terrorism in the physical world, that is, they have not often considered terrorism in terms of cyber or online terrorism or how the internet affects the dissemination of terrorist ideology and propaganda. At the 2016 Ise Shima Summit, G7 members discussed cyber-security broadly, but did not focus solely on the online aspect of terrorism. The 2017 Taormina Summit was the first time that the G7 members specifically mentioned online terrorism and discussed how to address it.¹⁵⁴

Commitment Features

At Taormina G7 leaders thus committed to “counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.”

“Support” refers to the action, or act of providing aid, assistance, or backing up an initiative, or entity.¹⁵⁵ “Counter” is to react to something with an opposing opinion or action, or to defend yourself against something.¹⁵⁶ “Propaganda” refers to information, ideas, opinions or images, often only giving one part of an argument, that are broadcast, published, or in some other way spread with the intention of influencing people’s opinions.¹⁵⁷ “Extremism” is the holding of extreme political or religious views; fanaticism.¹⁵⁸ “Radicalization” is the action or process of causing someone to adopt radical positions on political or social issues.¹⁵⁹ “Incitement” refers to the action of provoking

¹⁵⁰The ISIS Twitter Census Defining and Describing the Population of ISIS Supporters on Twitter, Brookings, (Washington, D.C.) 5 March 2015. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/the-isis-twitter-census-defining-and-describing-the-population-of-isis-supporters-on-twitter/>.

¹⁵¹ Tweets Still Must Flow, Twitter, (San Francisco) 26 January 2012. Access Date: 13 October 2017. https://blog.twitter.com/official/en_us/a/2012/tweets-still-must-flow.html.

¹⁵² Tweets Still Must Flow, Twitter, (San Francisco) 26 January 2012. Access Date: 13 October 2017. https://blog.twitter.com/official/en_us/a/2012/tweets-still-must-flow.html.

¹⁵³ Peter Kassig’s Powerful Silence Before ISIS Beheaded Him, Time, (New York) 17 November 2014. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <http://time.com/3589350/peter-kassigs-powerful-silence-before-isis-beheaded-him/>.

¹⁵⁴ 2016 Ise-Shima Final Compliance Report, University of Toronto G7 Research Group (Toronto) 25 May 2017. Access Date: 13 October 2017. <http://www.g8.utoronto.ca/evaluations/2016compliance-final/2016-g7-compliance-final.pdf>.

¹⁵⁵ Support, Compliance Coding Manual (Toronto) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁵⁶ Counter, Cambridge English Dictionary Online (Cambridge) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁵⁷ Propaganda, Cambridge English Dictionary Online (Cambridge) 2017. Access Date: 13 October 2017.

¹⁵⁸ Extremism, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁵⁹ Radicalization, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

unlawful behavior or urging someone to behave unlawfully.¹⁶⁰ Lastly, “violence” is behavior involving physical force intended to hurt, damage, or kill someone or something.¹⁶¹

The commitment made by the G7 members at the 2017 Taormina Summit is as follows: 1) to combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations; 2) to prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet; and 3) to avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

Examples of what could be done to achieve such ends are as follows:

1. To combat the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations, the G7 member could:
 - a) Work towards tackling the global issues such as poverty, illiteracy and poor education that provide terrorist organizations a base from which they can disseminate their propaganda, in physical form or online.¹⁶²
1. To prevent the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the internet, a G7 member could:
 - a) Present a positive counter-narrative to targeted groups, and suggest that those who seek to subvert and recruit do so out of malice.¹⁶³
2. To avoid the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers, a G7 member could:
 - a) Promote, at the governmental level, the “de-glamorizing” of terrorist organizations and espouse the experiences of significant muslim figures who speak out against the activities of terrorist organizations.¹⁶⁴

In terms of evaluating G7 members and their compliance to this commitment, they should be judged based on their ability to successfully limit the impacts of terrorist propaganda, and activity, online in relation to their tangible, real-world ramifications. As such, for full compliance the G7 member must take action to 1) counter terrorist propaganda that supports terrorism and violent extremism; 2) counter terrorist propaganda supporting online recruitment; and 3) counter terrorist propaganda supporting radicalization and incitement to violence. Partial compliance results if the G7 member has taken action in only one or two of the three areas, and non-compliance results if no action is taken.

¹⁶⁰ Incitement, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁶¹ Violence, Oxford English Dictionary Online (Oxford) 2017. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁶² A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁶³ A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

¹⁶⁴ A Strategy for Countering Terrorist Propaganda in the Digital Age, U.S. Department of State (Sydney, Australia) 12 June 2015. Access Date: 5 November 2017.

Scoring Guidelines

Score	Description
-1	Member does not apply the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, or the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.
0	Member recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism through the outlined avenues, however, only counters one OR two of the above facets of online terrorism.
+1	Member applies the necessary means to counter the proliferation of terrorist propaganda, online terrorist recruitment, and the radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

Lead Analyst: Nicholas Allard

Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 26 June 2017, the Interior Ministers and Attorney Generals of Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the United States, and the United Kingdom met at a five ministerial conference in Ottawa.¹⁶⁵ The meeting's resulting joint communiqué included pledges from the participating Ministers to commit to a series of practices to combat extremist groups. As part of this strategy were tactics that included engagement with key communication service providers, and utilizing traditional and social media to disrupt and counteract terrorist messaging.¹⁶⁶

On 29 June 2017, Canadian Defence Minister Harjit S. Sajjan and Foreign Affairs Minister Chrystia Freeland announced a renewal of Canada's commitment to the Global Coalition Against Daesh until 31 March 2019.¹⁶⁷ Among other tasks, the Global Coalition's mandate includes identifying and countering Daesh propaganda in order to delegitimize the terrorist organization's recruitment efforts.¹⁶⁸

On 6 July 2017, the Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence opened calls for proposals for funding from the Centre's newly created Community Resilience Fund.¹⁶⁹ According to Public Safety Canada, the Community Resilience Fund helps fund organizations seeking to enact programs and research to address radicalization of Canadians.¹⁷⁰ The Community Resilience Fund was allocated an initial CAD 2,400,000 to fund existing and new projects during the

¹⁶⁵ Five Country Ministerial 2017: Joint Communiqué, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 28 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/fv-cntry-mnstrl-2017/index-en.aspx>.

¹⁶⁶ Five Country Ministerial 2017: Joint Communiqué, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 28 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/fv-cntry-mnstrl-2017/index-en.aspx>.

¹⁶⁷ Canada Renews Contribution to the Global Coalition against Daesh, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 29 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/news/2017/06/canada_renews_contributiontotheglobalcoalitionagainstdaesh.html.

¹⁶⁸ Countering Daesh's Propaganda, Global Coalition Against Daesh 3 February 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://theglobalcoalition.org/en/countering-daeshs-propaganda/?lang=en>.

¹⁶⁹ New Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence supports local efforts, CISION (Ottawa) 26 June 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/new-canada-centre-for-community-engagement-and-prevention-of-violence-supports-local-efforts-630824813.html>.

¹⁷⁰ Community Resilience Fund, Public Safety Canada (Ottawa) 30 October 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/bt/cc/fnd-en.aspx>.

2017-2018 period, with another CAD 4,400,000 pledged for 2018-2019, and CAD 7,000,000 each year for 2019-2020 and beyond.¹⁷¹

On 12 September 2017, Member of Parliament Marc Miller announced on behalf of Public Safety Canada an investment from the Community Resilience Fund to support Project SOMEONE. Project SOMEONE (Social Media Education Every Day) is an online portal, designed to combat hate and radicalization towards violence. The funding for Project SOMEONE is intended to facilitate a better understanding of the production, usage, and online perception of hate speech.¹⁷²

On 5 April 2018, Canadian Minister of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness Ralph Goodale announced the launch of a public consultation on radicalization. The consultation, housed within the website of the Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence, is designed to gain insight from Canadians on how best to address radicalization towards violence.¹⁷³

From 25 April to 26 April 2017, Canadian law enforcement joined with its counterparts in Europe and the US to seize online servers allegedly operated by the Islamic State. Authorities targeted servers operated by Islamic State supporters, including the Amaq news agency, al-Bayan radio, and the Halumu and Nasher news sites. These news agencies had previously distributed Islamic State propaganda in the aftermath of several high-profile terrorist incidents in the US and Europe.¹⁷⁴

Canada has recognized the need to counter propaganda that supports terrorism, terrorist online recruitment, and radicalization and incitement to violence. Additionally, Canada has taken sufficient steps for implementing concrete actions against online terrorist propaganda.

Thus, Canada receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Geordie Jeakins

France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 2 August 2017, France contributed USD 980,600 to the United Nations Development Programme's Iraq Crisis Response and Resilience Programme to promote recovery and resilience-building in areas previously occupied by terrorist groups such as the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL).¹⁷⁵

¹⁷¹ Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence funds project to combat hate, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 12 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2017/09/canada_centre_forcommunityengagementandpreventionofviolencefunds.html.

¹⁷² Canada Centre for Community Engagement and Prevention of Violence funds project to combat hate, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 12 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.canada.ca/en/public-safety-canada/news/2017/09/canada_centre_forcommunityengagementandpreventionofviolencefunds.html.

¹⁷³ Canadians are invited to share their views on countering radicalization to violence, CISION (Ottawa) 5 April 2018. Access Date: 30 April, 2018. <https://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/canadians-are-invited-to-share-their-views-on-countering-radicalization-to-violence-678896393.html>.

¹⁷⁴ Canada, U.S., Europe seize servers used by Islamic State propaganda outlets, Globe and Mail (Toronto) 27 April 2018. Access Date: 30 April 2018. <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/world/article-canada-us-europe-seize-servers-used-by-islamic-state-propaganda/>.

¹⁷⁵ France contributes US\$980,600 to resilience in Iraq, United Nations Development Programme Iraq (Baghdad) 2 August 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.iq.undp.org/content/iraq/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2017/08/02/france-contributes-us-980-600-to-resilience-in-iraq-.html>.

On 26 August 2017, the French Minister for Europe and Foreign Affairs Jean-Yves Le Drian and Minister for the Armed Forces Florence Parly have confirmed the provision of EUR 430 million to the Government of Iraq to help post-conflict recovery and reconstruction through humanitarian aid and stabilization efforts with the overall aim to overcome terrorism.¹⁷⁶ France also contributed to this effort through its support for UN agencies.¹⁷⁷

On 13 June 2017, French President Emmanuel Macron and British Prime Minister Theresa May agreed to a joint initiative to tackle online terrorist and criminal activity.¹⁷⁸ The action plan highlights four priorities: improve online illegal content removal, support civil society actors' counter-narratives, ensure access to data during investigations and develop access to digital evidence for cross-border law enforcement.¹⁷⁹ Regarding access to data during investigations, France and the United Kingdom agreed to retain traffic and location data, share expertise on the identification of subscription holders and share strategies on accessing encrypted content.¹⁸⁰ The aforementioned action plan further mentions other steps, such as calling for an early meeting of G7 interior ministers to broaden its support.¹⁸¹

On 13 July 2017, France and Germany launched the Sahel Alliance, a multilateral mechanism aiming at coordinating economic development aid in Burkina Faso, Mali, Mauritania, Niger and Chad to provide faster and more efficient assistance in five sectors: “youth employability – education and training –; agriculture, rural development and food security; energy and climate; governance; decentralization and support for the deployment of basic services.”¹⁸²

On 20 September 2017 during the 72nd United Nations General Assembly in New York, President Emmanuel Macron reaffirmed France's commitment to counter propaganda through the rapid detection and removal of propaganda content on the Internet and support civil society discourse as an essential part of these counter-propaganda efforts.¹⁸³

France has implemented new measures to combat online extremism during the compliance period. It has taken concerted efforts to facilitate the fight against the proliferation of propaganda supporting terrorist organizations as well as facilitate the prevention of the misuse and recruitment of new supporters through the Internet. However, France did not take substantive actions to avoid and decrease the radicalization and incitement of terrorist sympathizers.

¹⁷⁶ L'après-daech : comment la France s'engage, Service d'information du Gouvernement (Paris) October 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.stop-djihadisme.gouv.fr/lutte-contre-terrorisme-radicalisation/laction-france-a-linternational/lapres-daech-comment-france>.

¹⁷⁷ L'après-daech : comment la France s'engage, Service d'information du Gouvernement (Paris) October 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <http://www.stop-djihadisme.gouv.fr/lutte-contre-terrorisme-radicalisation/laction-france-a-linternational/lapres-daech-comment-france>

¹⁷⁸ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹⁷⁹ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹⁸⁰ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹⁸¹ French-British Action Plan: internet security, GOV.UK (Paris) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/french-british-action-plan-internet-security>

¹⁸² G5 Sahel Joint Force and the Sahel Alliance, Ministry for Europe and Foreign Affairs (Paris). Access Date: 28 April 2018. <https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/defence-security/crisis-and-conflicts/g5-sahel-joint-force-and-the-sahel-alliance/>.

¹⁸³ Fight against terrorism/cyber security/digital technology — Speech by M. Emmanuel Macron, President of the Republic — 72nd United Nations General Assembly, Permanent mission of France to the United Nations in New York (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 7 November 2017. <https://onu.delegfrance.org/Fight-against-terrorism-it-s-a-challenge-we-share>.

On 23 February 2018, French Prime Minister Edouard Philippe announced a National Plan to Counter Radicalization consisting of sixty measures, among which some of them aim at improving the removal of inappropriate content on Internet platforms, supporting the research and development of tools to reduce “algorithmic confinement”¹⁸⁴ on the Internet, and developing counter-narratives in cooperation with Internet actors and the civil society.¹⁸⁵

On 20 March 2018, the Sahel Alliance launched in Mali the “ACTIF” project which aims at providing socio-economic integration and training opportunities for youths. France financed this EUR10 million project through the French Development Agency.¹⁸⁶

On 26 April 2018, France took part in the final declaration of the “No Money For Terror”¹⁸⁷ conference which emphasized active collaboration with the private sector, particularly the digital industry, to “combat [...] terrorist content on the internet, in particular terrorist recruitment, violent extremism leading to terrorism, notably through the dialogue initiated by some participating States and international organizations with internet platforms and social networks.”¹⁸⁸ The declaration also encouraged Internet platforms and social networks to promote civil society’s counter-arguments.¹⁸⁹

Thus, France receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Cecile Amiot

Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 14 June 2017, Germany’s Family and Interior Ministries announced a new national action plan against racism with a EUR100 million contribution being specifically targeted towards preventing Islamist radicalization and combating Islamic extremism.¹⁹⁰ Funds are to be utilized in a number of

¹⁸⁴ Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalization – dossier de presse, Service de presse de Matignon (Paris) 23 February 2018. Access Date: 28 April 2018. http://www.gouvernement.fr/sites/default/files/document/document/2018/02/dossier_de_presse_-_comite_interministeriel_de_prevention_de_la_delinquance_et_de_la_radicalisation_-_23.02.2018.pdf.

¹⁸⁵ Comité interministériel de prévention de la délinquance et de la radicalization – dossier de presse, Service de presse de Matignon (Paris) 23 February 2018. Access Date: 28 April 2018. http://www.gouvernement.fr/sites/default/files/document/document/2018/02/dossier_de_presse_-_comite_interministeriel_de_prevention_de_la_delinquance_et_de_la_radicalisation_-_23.02.2018.pdf.

¹⁸⁶ Sahel Alliance – Launch of a project to support Malian youth, Ministry for Europe and Foreign Affairs (Paris) 20 March 2018. Access Date: 28 April 2018. <https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/defence-security/events/article/sahel-alliance-launch-of-a-project-to-support-malian-youth-20-03-18>.

¹⁸⁷ MIL-OSI Translation: Communiqué – Final Declaration of the “No Money For Terror” Conference, MIL OSI - ForeignAffairs.co.nz (Paris) 27 April 2017. Access Date: 28 April 2017. <https://foreignaffairs.co.nz/2018/04/28/mil-osi-translation-communique-final-declaration-of-the-no-money-for-terror-conference/>.

¹⁸⁸ MIL-OSI Translation: Communiqué – Final Declaration of the “No Money For Terror” Conference, MIL OSI - ForeignAffairs.co.nz (Paris) 27 April 2017. Access Date: 28 April 2017. <https://foreignaffairs.co.nz/2018/04/28/mil-osi-translation-communique-final-declaration-of-the-no-money-for-terror-conference/>.

¹⁸⁹ MIL-OSI Translation: Communiqué – Final Declaration of the “No Money For Terror” Conference, MIL OSI - ForeignAffairs.co.nz (Paris) 27 April 2017. Access Date: 28 April 2017. <https://foreignaffairs.co.nz/2018/04/28/mil-osi-translation-communique-final-declaration-of-the-no-money-for-terror-conference/>.

¹⁹⁰ Germany presents racism action plan, invests millions into preventing extremism, Deutsche Welle (Bonne) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/germany-presents-racism-action-plan-invests-millions-into-preventing-extremism/a-39248515>.

ways including allocation to support mosque communities, while also investing in expanding the prevention of radicalization online.¹⁹¹

On 30 June 2017, German lawmakers approved a controversial law that would impose high fines on social media companies such as Facebook, Twitter, or YouTube for failing to delete explicitly hateful and criminal speech promptly within 24 hours of it being posted.¹⁹²

On 7 July 2017, the first day of the Hamburg G20 Summit, German Chancellor Angela Merkel stressed that terrorism poses a severe threat to everyone, and has damaging implications on free trade and economic growth.¹⁹³ She also emphasized the importance to share information more effectively as this applies to the work of Interpol, and strengthening the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to cap terrorists' sources of funding more effectively.¹⁹⁴ Merkel made it clear that the German government is making a concentrated effort to open discussion surrounding the internet and terrorism, and has highlighted the need for prompt removal of terrorist propaganda by online media and social networks.¹⁹⁵

On 24 August 2017, an amendment was made to the German Criminal Code of Procedure to expand the capacities of German law enforcement agencies to search online digital content and surveil telecommunications networks by exploiting software vulnerabilities without the consent or awareness of the subject.¹⁹⁶

On 25 August 2017, Germany successfully banned a left-wing extremist online platform it claimed to incite and fuel violent protests at the G20 summit in Hamburg in July. Interior Minister Thomas de Maizière said the website was shut down as well as its networks email, social media accounts, and its license to operate as an organization were cancelled for displaying hate and encouraging indecent behaviours.¹⁹⁷

Germany has made sufficient efforts to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, and radicalization and incitement to violence since its attendance at the Taormina Summit in May 2017. Its statements of collaboration with international partners, funding efforts for preventing radicalization, pressuring of social network companies to remove online content, and shutting down of domestic networks has demonstrated a willingness to comply.

¹⁹¹ Germany presents racism action plan, invests millions into preventing extremism, Deutsche Welle (Bonn) 14 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/germany-presents-racism-action-plan-invests-millions-into-preventing-extremism/a-39248515>.

¹⁹² Bundestag passes law to fine social media companies for not deleting hate speech, Deutsche Welle News. 30 June 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.dw.com/en/bundestag-passes-law-to-fine-social-media-companies-for-not-deleting-hate-speech/a-39486694>.

¹⁹³ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

¹⁹⁴ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

¹⁹⁵ G20 — First Day of the Summit, German Federal Government (Berlin) 7 July 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2017/07_en/2017-07-07-gipfel-freitag_en.html?nn=709674.

¹⁹⁶ Germany: Expanded Telecommunications Surveillance and Online Search Powers, Library of Congress (Washington, DC) 7 September 2017. Access Date: 21 November 2017. <http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/germany-expanded-telecommunications-surveillance-and-online-search-powers/>.

¹⁹⁷ Germany, In a First, Shuts Down Left-Wing Extremist Website, New York Times (New York) 25 August 2017. Access Date: 20 November 2017. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/25/world/europe/germany-bans-far-left-antifa-website.html>.

Thus, Germany receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Robert Hiff

Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 28 July 2017, Italy's executive branch, the Council of Ministers, chaired by Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni, issued press release no. 40 which outlined the approval of a regulation for the protection of personal data. This prohibits the collection of data on persons on the basis of their racial or ethnic origin, religious beliefs, etc., with the significant exception being that personal data can be used in the context of preventing or repressing organized crime, including terrorism.¹⁹⁸

On 20 September 2017, Prime Minister Paolo Gentiloni delivered a speech at the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA). In the speech, he reaffirmed Italy's G7 commitment to counter online recruitment by terrorists by pursuing initiatives to counter their use of the internet and social media.¹⁹⁹

On 20 September 2017, Prime Minister Gentiloni along with British Prime Minister Theresa May and French President Emmanuel Macron issued a joint statement in a side-event at the UNGA, which reiterated that Italy is resolved to prevent the misuse of the internet by terrorist groups and individual extremists.²⁰⁰ Along with the other two G7 members, Italy clarified its commitment to "working together to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content online and use of the Internet by terrorists to radicalize, recruit, inspire or incite."²⁰¹

On 2 November 2017, as per press release no. 55 by the Council of Ministers, new provisions concerning the interception of conversations or communications were introduced under Article 1 of the Criminal Code of Crime. This new provision outlines the contexts under which these interceptions can occur, with the most serious crimes, including terrorism, being the case.²⁰²

On 19 February 2018, the Italian parliament issued a legislative decree, in accordance with EU directive 681 of the European Parliament. This legislation outlines the regulatory obligation of internet providers and carriers to communicate data on persons suspected of terrorism and related

¹⁹⁸ Press Release of the Council of Ministers no. 40, Italian Government Presidency of the Ministers (Rome) 28 July 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.governo.it/articolo/comunicato-stampa-del-consiglio-dei-ministri-n-40/7891>.

¹⁹⁹ 72nd General Assembly of the United Nations. Statement by His Excellency, The President of the Council of Ministers, The Honourable Paolo Gentiloni, (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 20 November 2017. https://gadebate.un.org/sites/default/files/gastatements/72/it_en.pdf.

²⁰⁰ Statement by the United Kingdom, France and Italy at the High Level Meeting on the Prevention of Terrorists' Use of the Internet, New York, Presidency of the Republic (Paris) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. <http://www.elysee.fr/communiqués-de-presse/article/declaration-du-royaume-uni-de-la-france-et-de-l-italie-lors-de-la-reunion-de-haut-niveau-sur-la-prevention-de-l-utilisation-d-internet-par-les-terroristes-new-york-le-20-septembre-2017/>.

²⁰¹ Fight Against Terrorism: It's a Challenge We Share, Permanent Mission of France to the United Nations in New York (New York) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <https://onu.delegfrance.org/Fight-against-terrorism-it-s-a-challenge-we-share>.

²⁰² Press Release of the Council of Ministers no. 55, Italian Government Presidency of the Ministers (Rome) 2 November 2017. Access Date: 22 November 2017. <http://www.governo.it/articolo/comunicato-stampa-del-consiglio-dei-ministri-n-55/8373>.

serious crimes to the Italian government, in order to prevent, assess, investigate and prosecute offenses of such nature.²⁰³

On 30 March 2018, Italian police detained a Moroccan terror suspect, Ilyass Hadouz, on suspicion of “intense jihad propaganda.”²⁰⁴ The suspect is said to have perpetuated this propaganda online via home videos and extremist Islamist online chats.²⁰⁵

Italy has made effective contributions towards countering online recruitment by extremists and countering the radicalization and incitement to violence. However, while it has recognized the importance to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, Italy has not taken tangible policy measures to effectively counter these issues.

Thus, Italy receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Nicolas Di Marco

Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 15 June 2017, the Japanese parliament passed a new controversial anti-terrorism law designed to preemptively target conspiracies to commit terrorism and other various crimes. The legislation will criminalize the plotting and preparation of 277 specified crimes, including terrorism. Japanese Prime Minister Shinzo Abe defended the new bill, stating to reporters that the anti-terrorism law was needed in order to ratify the Transnational Crime Convention, a United Nations treaty targeting global organized crime, and protect the 2020 Tokyo Olympics.²⁰⁶ “We should cooperate with international society to prevent terrorism before it happens,”²⁰⁷ stated Abe.²⁰⁸

On 20 September 2017, Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, gave a statement at the Eight Global Counterterrorism Forum Ministerial Plenary Meeting in New York City. There, he stated, “Effective counter-terrorism requires mid- to long-term support to address the root-causes of terrorism in addition to immediate assistance.”²⁰⁹ Kono stated that Japan would assist developing countries prone to terrorism on strengthening border security and development solutions, such as poverty alleviation and education support, and conduct further research on how to counter violent extremism.²¹⁰

²⁰³ Legislative Decree of the Council of Ministers no.69, Italian Government Presidency of the Ministers (Rome) 19 February 2018. Access Date: 29 April 2018. <http://www.governo.it/provvedimento/provvedimento-a32028308021813/9016>.

²⁰⁴ Moroccan terror suspect detained in Italy, Euronews (Lyon) 30 March 2018. Access Date: 29 April 2018. <http://www.euronews.com/2018/03/30/moroccan-terror-suspect-detained-in-italy>

²⁰⁵ Moroccan terror suspect detained in Italy, Euronews (Lyon) 30 March 2018. Access Date: 29 April 2018. <http://www.euronews.com/2018/03/30/moroccan-terror-suspect-detained-in-italy>

²⁰⁶ Japan passes 'brutal' counter-terror law despite fears over civil liberties, The Guardian (London) 15 June 2017. Access Date: 17 May 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/jun/15/japan-passes-brutal-new-terror-law-which-opponents-fear-will-quash-freedoms>.

²⁰⁷ Japan passes pre-emptive anti-terrorism law, The Financial Times (New York) 15 June 2017. Access Date: 17 May 2018. <https://www.ft.com/content/75130598-5181-11e7-bfb8-997009366969>.

²⁰⁸ Japan passes pre-emptive anti-terrorism law, The Financial Times (New York) 15 June 2017. Access Date: 17 May 2018. <https://www.ft.com/content/75130598-5181-11e7-bfb8-997009366969>.

²⁰⁹ Statement by H.E. Mr. Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/files/000291685.pdf>.

²¹⁰ Statement by H.E. Mr. Taro Kono, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Japan, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan (Tokyo) 20 September 2017. Access Date: 15 November 2017. <http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/files/000291685.pdf>.

On 20 October 2017, Hachiro Okonogi, Chairperson of the National Public Safety Commission of Japan, signed on to a joint communiqué with other interior ministers at the G7 Interior Ministers' Meeting in Ischia, Italy, countering online threats of terrorism.²¹¹ The document reads, "Da'esh, al-Qaeda, and other terrorist and violent extremist organizations continue to exploit the Internet to spread propaganda, recruit operatives, incite violence and inspire attacks."²¹² The ministers encouraged both the private sector and civil society to "develop counter-narratives against [online] terrorist propaganda."²¹³

Japan recognizes the need to limit the proliferation of terrorism, and has passed measures to counter the preparation of these acts. However, the member has not explicitly applied means to oppose online terrorist recruitment or the online radicalization and incitement to violence among terrorist supporters.

Thus, Japan receives a score of 0.

Analyst: Ilya Bañares

United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 1 August 2017, former UK Home Secretary Amber Rudd met with senior executives from social media companies at the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism to urge the industry to step up their efforts in suppressing extremist content and terrorist propaganda on their online platforms.²¹⁴

On 20 September 2017, at a speech to United Nations General Assembly, Prime Minister Theresa stated that UN members must "work together to tackle the abuse of encrypted messaging apps to plan, direct and coordinate terrorist attacks."²¹⁵ That same day, the UK, France, and Italy released a joint statement on effective ways to counter online radicalization, propaganda, and recruitment. Noting that disseminators of terrorist propaganda release such information in rapid and multilateral fashions, the leaders called for "algorithmic confinement."²¹⁶ Prime Minister May also met with senior executives from Google, Facebook and Microsoft on the sidelines of the UN meeting to urge

²¹¹ Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers' Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 217.

<http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

²¹² Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers' Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 217.

<http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

²¹³ Fight against terrorism and violent extremism: turning commitments into action, G7 Interior Ministers' Meeting (Ischia) 20 October 2017. Access Date: 15 November 217.

<http://www.g7italy.it/sites/default/files/documents/Joint%20Communiqué.pdf>.

²¹⁴ Rudd asks Silicon Valley to do more to counter militants, Reuters (London) 31 July 2017. Access Date: 16 May 2018.

<https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-britain-security-idUKKBN1AG162>.

²¹⁵ PM speech at UNGA: preventing terrorist use of the internet, the Government of the United Kingdom (London) 21 September 2017. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/pm-speech-at-unga-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

²¹⁶ Statement by the UK, France and Italy on the leaders' meeting on preventing terrorist use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 17 September 21. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/statement-by-the-uk-france-and-italy-on-the-leaders-meeting-on-preventing-terrorist-use-of-the-internet>.

the industry to develop new technology that will automatically detect and remove online terrorist content before it is uploaded in the first place.²¹⁷

On 21 September 2017, the United Kingdom and the Global Solutions Exchange co-hosted an event on Innovations in Civil Society and other Locally Led Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Build Social Cohesion and Resilience.²¹⁸ The event focused on collaborating to build national action plans to prevent violent extremism by creating a more inclusive society.

On 3 October 2017, the British government proposed tangible, legislative measures to target repeated viewers of terrorist content. A Home Office memorandum outlined the framework: “The proposed changes will strengthen the existing offence of possessing information likely to be useful to a terrorist (Section 58 Terrorism Act 2000) so that it applies to material that is viewed repeatedly or streamed online.”²¹⁹ A sentence of up to 15 years would be considered, and attributing it to the aforementioned offence expands on pre-existing applications; “currently the power only applies to online material which has been downloaded and stored on the offender’s computer, is saved on a separate device or printed off as a hard copy.”²²⁰ Furthermore, the publishing of any information pertaining to public service officials, in civilian or military capacities, to facilitate acts of terrorism, is equally punishable by the newly tabled maximum penalty.

On 9 November 2017, former Home Secretary Rudd pressed tech companies to devise and implement artificial intelligence systems that will automatically detect and block online extremist content before they are posted on their networks at an event hosted by New America, a US think tank.²²¹

On 25 January 2018, Prime Minister May urged investors at the World Economic Forum in Davos, Switzerland, to place more pressure on major technology companies like Facebook and Twitter to respond more quickly to terrorist and extremist content on their online platforms. She stated that investors “can make a big difference here by ensuring trust and safety issues are being properly considered.”²²² May also stated that tech companies “still need to do more in stepping up to their responsibilities for dealing with harmful and illegal online activity,”²²³ and that governments should “look at the legal liability that social media companies have for the content on their sites.”²²⁴

On 13 February 2018, the Home Office announced the development of new technology with ASI Data Science that will utilize advanced machine learning to automatically detect terrorist propaganda

²¹⁷ May calls on internet firms to remove extremist content within two hours, the Guardian (London) 20 September 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2017/sep/19/theresa-may-will-tell-internet-firms-to-tackle-extremist-content>.

²¹⁸ Innovations in Civil Society and other Locally Led Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Build Social Cohesion and Resilience, Global Solutions Exchange (New York), 21 September 2018. Access Date: 8 April 2018.

<http://www.gsxpve.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/UNGA-GSX-Concept-Note-NAP-Side-Event.pdf>

²¹⁹ Law tightened to target terrorists' use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 3 October 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/law-tightened-to-target-terrorists-use-of-the-internet>.

²²⁰ Law tightened to target terrorists' use of the internet, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 3 October 2017. Access Date: 30 January 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/law-tightened-to-target-terrorists-use-of-the-internet>.

²²¹ British official urges social media companies to block militant content, Reuters (London) 9 November 2017. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://ca.reuters.com/article/technologyNews/idCAKBN1DA065-OCATC>.

²²² PM's speech at Davos 2018: 25 January, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 25 January 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/pms-speech-at-davos-2018-25-january>.

²²³ PM's speech at Davos 2018: 25 January, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 25 January 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/pms-speech-at-davos-2018-25-january>.

²²⁴ PM's speech at Davos 2018: 25 January, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 25 January 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/pms-speech-at-davos-2018-25-january>.

online. The tool is designed to be used “by any platform, and integrated into the upload process, so that the majority of video propaganda is stopped before it ever reaches the internet.”²²⁵ The Home Office stated that that they will share the methodology behind the new technology with smaller tech firms that are more vulnerable to being targeted by terrorist content than major tech companies.²²⁶

On 14 February 2018, former UK Home Secretary Rudd joined the US Secretary of Homeland Security Kirstjen Nielsen to participate in the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention in Silicon Valley.²²⁷ They met with tech industry leaders and experts to discuss efforts to counter online terrorist radicalization and recruitment. Both parties “pressed for decisive action against digital terrorist propaganda”²²⁸ and emphasized the importance of public-private collaboration in combating online extremism. At the forum, the UK Home Office and the US Countering Violent Extremism Task Force announced the launch of a new “social media awareness briefing”²²⁹ for the purposes of bringing more awareness of “online terrorist trends”²³⁰ to tech companies in order to “help startups and content moderators increase their understanding of the danger and develop more effective mitigation strategies.”²³¹

The United Kingdom has taken significant measures to promote international awareness and dialogue against online extremism; proposed legislative measures aimed at targeting terrorists' use of the internet; pressed the global technology sector to step up their efforts in countering extremist content and terrorist recruitment on their online platforms; and worked collaboratively with the private sector to produce new technology that will streamline the detection and removal of digital propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism.

Thus, the United Kingdom receives a score of +1.

Analysts: Anders Bretsen and Bryan Rob

²²⁵ New technology revealed to help fight terrorist content online, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 13 February 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/new-technology-revealed-to-help-fight-terrorist-content-online>.

²²⁶ New technology revealed to help fight terrorist content online, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 13 February 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/new-technology-revealed-to-help-fight-terrorist-content-online>.

²²⁷ Joint statement by US Secretary of Homeland Security and the Home Secretary, Government of the United Kingdom (London) 14 February 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/joint-statement-by-us-secretary-of-homeland-security-and-the-home-secretary>.

²²⁸ DHS Secretary Nielsen Discusses Online Counterterrorism Efforts at the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention, Department of Homeland Security (Washington, D.C.) 6 March 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.dhs.gov/blog/2018/03/06/dhs-secretary-nielsen-discusses-online-counterterrorism-efforts-2018-digital-forum>.

²²⁹ DHS Secretary Nielsen Discusses Online Counterterrorism Efforts at the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention, Department of Homeland Security (Washington, D.C.) 6 March 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.dhs.gov/blog/2018/03/06/dhs-secretary-nielsen-discusses-online-counterterrorism-efforts-2018-digital-forum>.

²³⁰ DHS Secretary Nielsen Discusses Online Counterterrorism Efforts at the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention, Department of Homeland Security (Washington, D.C.) 6 March 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.dhs.gov/blog/2018/03/06/dhs-secretary-nielsen-discusses-online-counterterrorism-efforts-2018-digital-forum>.

²³¹ DHS Secretary Nielsen Discusses Online Counterterrorism Efforts at the 2018 Digital Forum on Terrorism Prevention, Department of Homeland Security (Washington, D.C.) 6 March 2018. Access Date: 16 May 2018. <https://www.dhs.gov/blog/2018/03/06/dhs-secretary-nielsen-discusses-online-counterterrorism-efforts-2018-digital-forum>.

United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 11 July 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Working Groups on Counter Finance, Foreign Terrorist Fighters, Stabilization Support and Communications met separately. The discussions focused on the campaign and how to increasingly restrain ISIS.²³²

On 12 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy met with the rest of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS to discuss the means by which to increase efforts to defeat ISIS in Iraq and Syria. Also discussed was how to impact the effect on its branches, affiliates and networks throughout the world.²³³

On 13 July, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS Small Group met to discuss how to defeat ISIS by strengthening the progress in Mosul and Raqqa. A special meeting was also held for agents from some African countries, the African Union, and the Multinational Joint Task force on ISIS in the Lake Chad Basin region.²³⁴

From 29 August to 4 September, 2017, the United States Ambassador-at-Large for Counterterrorism, Nathan A. Sales, travelled to Brussels, London and Paris. There he discussed continuing joint efforts to fight against the terrorism threat in Europe and globally.²³⁵

On 20 September, 2017, the United States Global Terrorism Forum published a fact sheet on how to recognize “civilian counter terrorism needs, mobilize the necessary expertise and resources to support capacity building and enhance global counterterrorism cooperation.”²³⁶

On 20-21 September, 2017, the United States government partnered with Peru to hold a two-day workshop in Lima, Peru. This workshop was on how to use law enforcement and counterterrorism finance tools to combat Hezbollah’s activities.²³⁷

On 3 October, 2017, the United States Acting Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for Political-Military Affairs Michael Miller and Bangladesh Director General for the Americas at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Abida Islam chaired the Sixth U.S.-Bangladesh Bilateral Security Dialogue at the U.S. Department of State in Washington DC. Discussions focused on expanding partnerships in counterterrorism, among other issues.²³⁸

²³² Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

²³³ Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

²³⁴ Meeting of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 5 July 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/07/272362.htm>.

²³⁵ Ambassador-at-Large for Counterterrorism Nathan A. Sales to Travel to Europe, U.S. State Department 29 August 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/08/273691.htm>.

²³⁶ Global Counterterrorism Forum Deliverables Fact Sheet, U.S. State Department 20 September 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/09/274303.htm>

²³⁷ U.S.-Peru Workshop on Countering Hizballah’s Terrorist and Criminal Activities, U.S. State Department 22 September 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/09/274379.htm>

²³⁸ U.S.-Bangladesh Bilateral Security Dialogue, U.S. State Department 3 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/10/274581.htm>

On 4 October, 2017, the United States Department of State held the U.S.-China Law Enforcement and Cybersecurity Dialogue in Washington DC. The Dialogue discussed important areas of the U.S.-China relationship on counterterrorism, among other issues.²³⁹

On 30 October, 2017, the United States government pledged up to USD 60 million to support the G5 Sahel Joint Forces counter terrorism efforts. It is to support the United States regional partners who are fighting to ensure security and stability against ISIS, affiliated groups and other terrorist networks.²⁴⁰

On 8 November, 2017, the United States and Qatari officials met in Washington D.C. for the first U.S.-Qatari counter terrorism dialogue. The delegations reviewed Qatar's positive progress in implementing the U.S.-Qatar counterterrorism Memorandum of Understanding signed in Doha on 11 July.²⁴¹

On 15 November, 2017, the United States Special Presidential Envoy for the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS met with key members of the Defeat ISIS Coalition in Amman, Jordan. At the meeting the Coalition partners discussed the next steps to ensure ISIS is dealt an enduring defeat in Iraq and Syria and ways to accelerate their collective approach to defeat ISIS's global ambitions.²⁴²

On 15-16 November 2017, the United States government and the Kingdom of Morocco launched a global initiative to address homegrown terrorism. To address homegrown terrorism, the initiative's launch brought together over 70 government officials, law enforcement officers, academics, and non-governmental representatives from 25 countries.²⁴³

On 14 December 2017, the US met more than 25 governments for the Law Enforcement Coordination Group's fifth meeting in Europe. The meeting was focused on countering Hizballah's terrorist activities.²⁴⁴

On 18-19 December 2017, the US took part in the first U.S.-India Counterterrorism Designations Dialogue in New Delhi, India where the discussions focused on increasing bilateral cooperation on terrorism-related designations.²⁴⁵

On 21 December 2017, as a member of the UN, the US adopted a new resolution that will help detect and counter threats from foreign terrorist fighters. The US led the negotiation of this new resolution to demonstrate their commitment to fighting terrorism. This resolution requires all UN members to use Passenger Name Record data, Advanced Passenger Information, to collect biometric

²³⁹ U.S.-China Law Enforcement and Cybersecurity Dialogue, U.S State Department 3 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/10/274590.htm>

²⁴⁰ United States Pledging up to \$60 Million in New Support for Security Assistance in the Sahel Region, U.S State Department 30 October 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/secretary/remarks/2017/10/275175.htm>

²⁴¹ First U.S.-Qatar Counterterrorism Dialogue, U.S State Department 8 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275409.htm>

²⁴² Meeting of the Small Group of the Global Coalition to Defeat ISIS in Jordan, U.S. State Department 9 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275441.htm>

²⁴³ Initiative to Address Homegrown Terrorism Launch Event Held in Valletta, Malta, U.S State Department (Washington, D.C.) 16 November 2017. Access Date: 24 November 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/11/275689.htm>.

²⁴⁴ Fifth Meeting of the Law Enforcement Coordination Group Focused on Countering Hizballah's Terrorist Activities, U.S. State Department (Washington D.C.) 14 December 2017. Access Date: 30 April 2018. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/12/276609.htm>.

²⁴⁵ Joint Statement on the First U.S.-India Counterterrorism Designations Dialogue, U.S. State Department (Washington, D.C.) 19 December 2017. Access Date: 30 April 2018. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/12/276679.htm>.

data, develop watchlists of known and suspected terrorists, and encourages UN members to share counterterrorism information with each other.²⁴⁶

On 20 March 2018, the Coordinator for Counterterrorism Ambassador-at-Large, Nathan A. Sales, represented the US in the Thirteenth Coordinating Committee Meeting of the Global Counterterrorism Forum in Tokyo, Japan. Mr. Sales presented a new initiative co-led by the US and Morocco, the Initiative on Improving Capabilities for Detecting and Interdicting Terrorist Travel through Enhanced Terrorist Screening and Information Sharing. The new initiative focuses on potential weaknesses or gaps in states' capacities to create watchlists and share information.²⁴⁷

On 27 April 2018, US law enforcement teams, along with European teams, disabled key communication channels of ISIS. The eight countries of US, Bulgaria, Canada, France, the Netherlands, Romania, and the UK, engaged in a two-day takedown that targeted ISIS stamped media outlets.²⁴⁸

The United States has recognized the need to counter propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the United States receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Sonja Dobson

European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

On 19 July 2017, the European Commission reported on the actions taken on countering hybrid threats, as were implemented in the 2016 Joint Framework.²⁴⁹ Hybrid threats combine both conventional and unconventional methods such as cyber-attacks and media manipulation.²⁵⁰ This report entailed a description of the Communication Task Forces that had been established between “Eastern and Southern Neighbourhoods,”²⁵¹ the Task Force on Cyber-Security, cooperation with

²⁴⁶ On the Adoption of UN Security Council Resolution 2396 on Foreign Terrorist Fighters, U.S. State Department (Washington, D.C.) 21 December 2017. Access Date: 30 April 2018. <https://www.state.gov/secretary/20172018/tillerson/remarks/2017/12/276749.htm>.

²⁴⁷ Thirteenth Global Counterterrorism Forum (GCTF) Coordinating Committee Meeting, Tokyo, Japan, U.S. State Department (Washington, D.C.) 21 March 2018. Access Date: 30 April 2017. <https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2018/03/279437.htm>.

²⁴⁸ US-EU operation deals blow to ISIS propaganda machine, The Guardian (London) 27 April 2018. Access Date: 30 April 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/apr/27/isis-media-outlets-immobilised-us-eu-amaq>.

²⁴⁹ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

²⁵⁰ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

²⁵¹ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe's Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

third countries, and cooperation between the EU and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization.²⁵² The European Union used this report to announce the development of an operational protocol that would outline coordination between intelligence collection and analysis regarding online terrorism and resilience in security.²⁵³

On 14 September 2017, the European Union adopted a programme worth EUR 17.5 million to address terrorist threats in the Middle East and North Africa. This three-year programme is aimed to address the drivers and threats from terrorism in these regions to build resilience against terrorism and radicalization leading to violent extremism.²⁵⁴ Federica Mogherini, the High Representative and Vice-President of the European Commission, stated that cooperation on counterterrorism would be an increased priority within Europe and with its partners. This programme will strengthen the capacity of state actors in countering terrorism, and will also focus on youth and communities in addressing factors that lead to vulnerability to violent extremism and radicalization.²⁵⁵

On 28 September 2017, President Jean-Claude Juncker accompanied his State of the Union speech (which was held on 13 September 2017) with a presentation of guidelines and principles for online platforms. This new program would increase the “proactive prevention, detection, and prompt removal of illegal content inciting hatred, violence, and terrorism online.”²⁵⁶ This weeding out of illegal content would include a more streamlined process for detection and notification by trusted flaggers and the promotion of investment in automatic detection technologies, effective removal and transparency reports, as well as the prevention of re-appearance and repeated uploading of this illegal content.²⁵⁷ President Juncker stated that the next steps, which are to be completed by May 2018, are to monitor progress of online platforms and to later assess whether additional measures are necessary, including possible legislative measures.²⁵⁸

On 18 October 2017, Commissioner Julian King spoke at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror.”²⁵⁹ In his speech, King addressed the proliferation of radicalization and proliferation of terrorist propaganda, and called on the importance of closing the spaces in which terrorism operates and closing loopholes in terms of recruitment and

²⁵² Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe’s Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

²⁵³ Security and Defence: Significant Progress to Enhance Europe’s Resilience Against Hybrid Threats — More Work Ahead, European Commission (Valletta) 20 July 2017. Access Date: 19 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/malta/news/security-and-defence-significant-progress-enhance-europes-resilience-against-hybrid-threats--_en.

²⁵⁴ European Union Steps Up Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Counter-Terrorism in the Middle East and North Africa, European Commission (Brussels) 14 September 2017. Access Date: 17 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3225_en.htm.

²⁵⁵ European Union Steps Up Efforts to Prevent Violent Extremism and Counter-Terrorism in the Middle East and North Africa, European Commission (Brussels) 14 September 2017. Access Date: 17 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3225_en.htm.

²⁵⁶ Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

²⁵⁷ Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

²⁵⁸ Security Union: Commission Steps Up Efforts to Tackle Illegal Content Online, European Commission (Brussels) 28 September 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-3493_en.htm.

²⁵⁹ Commissioner King’s Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on “Building Alliances — Preventing Terror”, (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

means.²⁶⁰ He explicitly stated that over 38,000 pieces of content were referred by the Europe internet referral unit, and 85% were removed.²⁶¹ This speech on 18 October 2017 reiterated the success of the European Union's Radicalization Awareness Network, which connects individuals involved in preventing radicalization and violent extremism throughout Europe.²⁶² While this project is ongoing, Commissioner King spoke of success in its working groups such as the Communications and Narratives working group, which acts to deliver on-and-offline communication that counters extremist propaganda, the Education Working Group, which brings together first-line education practitioners to empower them in countering radicalization, as well as the Health and Social Care working group, which interprets signs of radicalization and helps those at risk of incitement to violence.²⁶³

On 27 November 2017, EU Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos announced at the Eighth Annual Bosphorus Summit, held in Istanbul, Turkey, that the EU Internet Forum had voluntarily partnered with the internet industry, and has regulated and seen to 95% of terrorist content being automatically removed by companies.²⁶⁴ Avramopoulos addressed the hope for more companies to join this collaboration, and spoke of the success of the Radicalisation Awareness Network's reach to countries outside of Europe.²⁶⁵

On 22 March 2018, Commissioner Julian King spoke at the Second Annual EPC/EFD Conference regarding the changes made in the European Union to combat extremism at home and abroad. In this speech, King argued that combating terrorism must not only be through erecting physical barriers, but preventing radicalization of vulnerable European-born citizens. Further, King noted that Rob Wainwright, the Executive Director at Europol, said that there were currently 30,000 individuals in Europe potentially involved in extremist activity. With these rising threats of homegrown extremism, Commissioner King called on online platforms to take greater proactive responsibility for keeping their users safe. The EU has put out a recommendation to require internet companies to take down terror content one hour after being notified by law enforcement as well as to use automatic detection tools to prevent appearance.²⁶⁶ Further, these platforms would need to improve

²⁶⁰ Commissioner King's Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on "Building Alliances — Preventing Terror", (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

²⁶¹ Commissioner King's Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on "Building Alliances — Preventing Terror" (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en

²⁶² Commissioner King's Remarks at the Counter Extremism Project Conference on "Building Alliances — Preventing Terror" (Brussels) 18 October 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017.

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-remarks-counter-extremism-project-conference-building-alliances-preventing-terror_en.

²⁶³ RAN Working Groups (Brussels) 25 November 2017. Access Date: 18 November 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/networks/radicalisation_awareness_network/about-ran_en.

²⁶⁴ Remarks by Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos at the 8th Bosphorus Summit, European Commission (Brussels) 27 November 2017. Access Date: 8 January 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/avramopoulos/announcements/remarks-commissioner-dimitris-avramopoulos-8th-bosphorus-summit_en

²⁶⁵ Remarks by Commissioner Dimitris Avramopoulos at the 8th Bosphorus Summit, European Commission (Brussels) 27 November 2017. Access Date: 8 January 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/avramopoulos/announcements/remarks-commissioner-dimitris-avramopoulos-8th-bosphorus-summit_en

²⁶⁶ Commissioner King's Speech to the Second Annual EPC/EFD Conference: 'Two Years After the Brussels Attacks: The Challenges of Jihadist Radicalization in Europe and Beyond,' European Commission (Brussels) 22 March 2018. Access Date: 18 April 2018. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-speech-second-annual-epcefd-conference-two-years-after-brussels-attacks_en.

cooperation with law enforcement and to notify these authorities of their identifications of “illegal terrorist content.”²⁶⁷

The European Union has made effective contributions to countering propaganda supporting terrorism and violent extremism, online recruitment by extremists, radicalization and incitement to violence.

Thus, the European Union receives a score of +1.

Analyst: Courtney Amanda Wong

²⁶⁷ Commissioner King’s Speech to the Second Annual EPC/EFD Conference: ‘Two Years After the Brussels Attacks: The Challenges of Jihadist Radicalization in Europe and Beyond,’ European Commission (Brussels) 22 March 2018. Access Date: 18 April 2018. https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2014-2019/king/announcements/commissioner-kings-speech-second-annual-epcefd-conference-two-years-after-brussels-attacks_en.